GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT
LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO:821
ANSWERED ON:21.11.2016
No Detention Policy
Baker Shri George;Dhruvanarayana Shri Rangaswamy;Gaddigoudar Shri Parvatagouda Chandanagouda;Galla Shri Jayadev;Gavit Dr. Heena Vijaykumar;Gutha Shri Sukender Reddy;Khadse Smt. Raksha Nikhil;Rai Shri Prem Das;Reddy Shri Mekapati Rajamohan;Reddy,Kotha Prabhakar;Senguttuvan Shri Balasubramaniam;Suresh Shri Doddaalahalli Kempegowda;Trivedi Shri Dinesh;Venugopal Shri K. C.

Will the Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is true that there has been a significant decline in learning outcomes in schools across the country and if so, whether the Government is considering to review No Detention Policy in this regard;
(b) whether the Government has received representation from various stakeholders/State Governments seeking to revoke the No Detention Policy in schools and if so, the details thereof;
(c) whether the Government had constituted various Committees to revive the said Policy and if so, the details of each Committee including the recommendations and action of the Government thereon;
(d) whether the Government has sought legal opinion regarding the scrapping of the said Policy and if so, the details thereof; and
(e) whether the Government is also in receipt of opinions against the discontinuation of the No-Detention Policy including from NCERT and if so, the details thereof ?

Answer

MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI UPENDRA KUSHWAHA)
(a) & (b) : The National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT) conducts periodic national surveys of learning achievement of children in classes − III, V, VIII and X

which indicates that there is a need for significant improvement in learning levels. Out of 28 States and UTs that have shared their views on the 'No Detention' policy, 23 States have suggested modification to the No Detention policy. The summary of the responses received from State Governments and UT Administrations on 'No Detention' policy is at Annexure-I.
(c): A Sub-Committee of the Central Advisory Board of Education (CABE) under the Chairpersonship of Smt. Geeta Bhukkal, Education Minister, Government of Haryana was constituted for assessment of implementation of Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) in the context of 'No-Detention' provision in the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education (RTE) Act, 2009. The recommendation of the Committee on the roll out plan of 'No Detention' policy, is as under:
"Given current systemic challenges and process inefficiencies, "No detention" provision should be implemented in a phased manner. For example, to begin with, we could implement a system of state wide assessment at grades 3,5 and 8 − with "no detention" up to grade 5, provisional promotion after grade 5 and detention after level 8 (if minimum grade-appropriate competencies are not achieved by the child). However, scale up to all classes should be undertaken only after the critical infrastructural, teacher strength and teachers' skill-set requirements are fully met (e.g. by 2020 or 2024).
The system should allow for detaining students lagging behind (e.g., a student who has not attained grade − 3 competency even though reached age-appropriate level of grade 5 or has not attained grade 5 competency even though reached age appropriate level of grade 8). The school needs to provide special training to support him or her in acquisition of grade appropriate competencies. Such changes will help address concerns that result from a system-wide "No detention" policy, and will help expedite the country's process towards higher quality education for all."
Another Sub-Committee of CABE under the Chairpersonship of Shri Vasudev Devnani Minister of Education, Government of Rajasthan was constituted on 26.10.2015 inter-alia, to review the feedback received from States / UTs on the 'No-Detention' policy. Apart from other recommendations of the Sub-Committee, the recommendations on 'No Detention' are as
â€¦3/-
-3-
under:

'There should be an examination at Class 5. It should be left to the States and UT's to decide whether this exam will be at the block, district, or State level. If a child fails then allow the child an opportunity to improve. There should be additional instruction provided to children and the child should be given an opportunity to sit for another exam. If the child is unable to pass the exam in the second chance, then detain the child. At Classes 6 and 7, there should be a school based exam for students. At class 8, there should be an external exam. In case the child fails the child should be given additional instruction and then appear for an improvement exam. If fails again, then detain.'

Another Sub-Committee of the Central Advisory Board of Education (CABE) was formed for the purpose of improving the state of Government schools in the country under the Chairpersonship of Dr. Daljit Singh Cheema, Education Minister of Punjab. The recommendations of the Sub-Committee as regards Learning Outcomes and the 'No Detention' policy are as under:

"Assessment of Student Learning as an Integral Part of Pedagogy - Define comprehensive benchmarks of student learning for each stage of education - Make available exemplar tools and processes for assessment aligned to the benchmarks - Build teacher capability in the area of assessment (Assessment Literacy) - Empower teachers to design classroom pedagogy, choose curricular material and select assessment processes - Implement Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) in its true spirit

Review "no detention" policy: It should be noted that the 'no detention' policy adopted in the light of RTE 2009 has proven to be counterproductive."

A meeting of CABE was held on 25.10.2016 in New Delhi wherein a decision was taken in the meeting that the Central Government may bring in suitable amendment to the RTE Act, 2009 which will give States the freedom to review the 'No Detention' Policy. It was

â€¦4/-

-4-

decided to apply 'no detention' provision up to Class V and the States/UTs may decide to detain children for Class 6, Class 7 or Class 8, however, the child should be given one opportunity to pass the respective class before being promoted to the next class.

(d): Any change in No Detention Policy would require amendment to the RTE Act, 2009. Accordingly, the Ministry has sought comments of Ministry of Law and Justice on the issue.

(e): The NCERT has suggested that for the success of No Detention Policy, there is a need to prepare the ground to strengthen Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) empowering teachers through pre-service and in-service teacher training programmes. Learning outcomes are in built in the syllabus and textbooks. NCERT has developed Learning Indicators and Learning Outcomes for Elementary Stage as an exemplar for guiding the States and UT's. Defining learning outcomes and indicators will facilitate monitoring of students' against expected benchmarks, organizing additional instruction for children who have learning gaps and sharing progress of the child with parents or guardians. It will help identify the overall performance of a school with regard to learning and teacher effectiveness. The Government has decided to put Learning Outcomes in the Rules of the RTE Act 2009. Comments of State Governments which are against the discontinuation of the 'No Detention' policy are also mentioned in the Annexure-I.

*****